

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF GEORGIA
ATLANTA DIVISION**

**DONALD J. TRUMP, in his capacity)
as a Candidate for President of the)
United States,)**

Plaintiff,)

v.)

**BRIAN P. KEMP, in his official)
capacity as Governor of the State of)
Georgia; BRAD RAFFENSPERGER,)
in his official capacity as Georgia)
Secretary of State,)**

Defendants.)

Civil Action No. 1:20-cv-05310-MHC

RESPONSE TO PLAINTIFF’S NOTICE OF VOLUNTARY DISMISSAL

Defendants do not object to the voluntary dismissal. Defendants do object to the false grounds articulated in the Notice. Plaintiff Donald J. Trump voluntarily dismissed this litigation contending the dismissal is a result of settlement between the Parties. It is not. There is no “settlement.” The demonstrably false characterizations by Plaintiff’s counsel are addressed herein in this response.

Plaintiff’s counsel inquired on numerous occasions about settling the disputes, including the pending state court matters, between the Parties. Those inquiries were repeatedly rebuffed by Defendants on the grounds that Plaintiff’s litigation efforts were frivolous and the certified results of the November 3, 2020, Election were valid.

Without notifying Defendants' counsel, Plaintiff and his litigation counsel participated in a phone conference with Defendant Raffensperger on Saturday January 2, 2020. The participation of counsel for Plaintiff in that call appears to be in violation of the Georgia Rules of Professional Conduct Rule 4.2, as Plaintiff's counsel neither notified litigation counsel for Defendant Raffensperger nor sought nor obtained consent to conduct or participate in a conversation with Defendant Raffensperger. This action by Plaintiff's counsel was undertaken despite the fact that the substance of the call concerned not only this action but also two pending state superior court matters and a pending appeal in the Georgia Supreme Court in which Defendant Raffensperger was represented by counsel, all of which was known to Plaintiff's counsel.

After that call, Defendants' counsel told Plaintiff there would be no discussions between the parties until Plaintiff dismissed all of their litigations. *See* Notice Ex. 1. Yesterday evening at 9:36 p.m., Plaintiff's counsel sent a letter to Defendants' counsel stating that they would dismiss their various frivolous complaints pursuant to a "settlement" between the Parties. *See* Notice Ex. 2.

Defendants' counsel responded by email yesterday evening confirming there was absolutely no settlement between the Parties and reiterating that Plaintiff's claims were frivolous. ***See Exhibit A*** attached hereto. Plaintiff's counsel responded to that email notification that no "settlement" was contemplated nor agreed to by

stating his intention to unilaterally dismiss all pending actions against Defendants. **See Exhibit B** attached hereto. Plaintiff's counsel failed to include that response or his reply after that clear statement that this was not pursuant to a settlement but instead a unilateral dismissal in his filed Notice of Voluntary Dismissal. While Defendants are appreciative of this voluntary dismissal and the cessation by Plaintiff of this groundless litigation, as officers of the court it is expected that all matters before the Court will be handled with complete candor. The Defendants make this response to ensure that the actual record of what has transpired is accurately reflected in the docket.

Respectfully submitted this 7th day of January, 2021.

Christopher M. Carr
Attorney General
Georgia Bar No. 112505
Bryan K. Webb
Deputy Attorney General
Georgia Bar No. 743580
Russell D. Willard
Senior Assistant Attorney General
Georgia Bar No. 760280
Charlene S. McGowan
Assistant Attorney General
Georgia Bar No. 697316
**OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY
GENERAL**
Georgia Department of Law
40 Capitol Square SW
Atlanta, Georgia, 30334
Telephone: (404) 458-3600
Facsimile: (404) 657-8733

/s/ Christopher S. Anulewicz

Christopher S. Anulewicz

Georgia Bar No. 020914

canulewicz@balch.com

James L. Hollis

Georgia Bar No. 930998

jhollis@balch.com

Jonathan R. DeLuca

Georgia Bar No. 228413

jdeluca@balch.com

Patrick N. Silloway

Georgia Bar No. 971966

psilloway@balch.com

BALCH & BINGHAM LLP

30 Ivan Allen Jr. Blvd. N.W., Suite 700

Atlanta, GA 30308

Telephone: (404) 261-6020

Facsimile: (404) 261-3656

*Attorneys for Defendants Brian Kemp and
Brad Raffensperger*

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on the 7th day of January, 2021 I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of Court using the CM/ECF system, which will automatically send email notifications of such filing the following counsel of record:

Kurt R. Hilbert
THE HILBERT LAW FIRM, LLC
205 Norcross Street
Roswell, GA 30075
khilbert@hilbertlaw.com

John Charles Eastman
174 W. Lincoln Avenue
#620
Anaheim, CA 92805
Jeastman562@gmail.com

/s/ Christopher S. Anulewicz _____
Christopher S. Anulewicz
Georgia Bar No. 020914

EXHIBIT A

Anulewicz, Chris

From: Anulewicz, Chris
Sent: Thursday, January 7, 2021 12:29 AM
To: Kurt Hilbert
Cc: ccarr@law.ga.gov; trevis@hilbertlaw.com; Ray S. Smith, III; dfg@guldenschuhlaw.com; rwillard@law.ga.gov
Subject: Re: Confidential

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up
Flag Status: Flagged

Mr. Hilbert—

Thank you for your correspondence of earlier tonight. While I appreciate the willingness of you and your clients to avoid protracted litigation in which, as indicated in my letter of January 3, 2020, we strongly believe the State will prevail, I want to make sure that there are no misunderstandings about either my letter or what the Secretary is willing to do once the pending cases have been dismissed. The letter was not a settlement offer, as you characterize it, but simply a statement that my client was not able to sit down and discuss the issues raised by your clients while there was active litigation by your clients against my client and other state officials. As a result, unless and until your clients met the condition precedent of dismissing all pending cases against state officials, my client would not be able to sit down and discuss the data analysis included in your clients' complaints, including showing how both the underlying data and the accompanying analysis are flawed.

As your clients have now indicated an intent to dismiss the pending cases, my client's offer to voluntarily sit down and discuss, as stated in my letter of January 3, 2020, "as much information with you as we can" outside of the context of ongoing litigation can proceed following your clients' voluntary dismissal of the identified litigation. We cannot agree to provide you access to information that is required by law to remain confidential, but that information should not be necessary to complete the type of discussion contemplated in the prior conversation with Ryan Germany comparing the information relied upon by your experts with the information utilized in the conduct of Georgia's electoral process. While your letter does not specifically state that your clients desire access to confidential information, I wanted to make clear that the Secretary cannot agree to such a request if that was contemplated in your stated intention to dismiss the litigation to complete the Secretary's condition precedent to voluntarily sitting down with you outside the threat of ongoing litigation.

Once your client has voluntarily dismissed the litigation identified in your letter, you can work through Russell Willard and Charlene McGowan in the Attorney General's office to set up a meeting with the Secretary's office. Once the litigation is dismissed, my appointment as a Special Assistant Attorney General will conclude. I look forward to receiving confirmation of the dismissal of the identified litigation. Otherwise, we stand ready to proceed with the scheduled hearing and trial on Friday.

Chris Anulewicz

Sent from my iPhone



Christopher S. Anulewicz, Partner, Balch & Bingham LLP
30 Ivan Allen Jr. Boulevard, N.W. • Suite 700 • Atlanta, GA 30308-3036
t: (404) 962-3562 f: (866) 320-6758 e: canulewicz@balch.com
www.balch.com

On Jan 6, 2021, at 9:36 PM, Kurt Hilbert <khilbert@hilbertlaw.com> wrote:

[External Email] Please use caution.

General Carr and Chris-

Please see the attached acceptance letter of your settlement terms from Sunday.

Have a pleasant evening. I look forward to coordinating promptly as per the letter attached.

Kurt R. Hilbert, Esq.
Managing Member

<image001.png>

THE HILBERT LAW FIRM, LLC

Mailing Address:
205 Norcross Street
Roswell, GA 30075
T: 770-551-9310
F: 770-551-9311
khilbert@hilbertlaw.com
www.hilbertlaw.com

IRS Circular 230 disclosure: To ensure compliance with requirements imposed by the IRS, we inform you that any U.S. federal tax advice contained in this communication (including any attachments) is not intended or written to be used, and cannot be used, for the purpose of (a) avoiding penalties under the Internal Revenue Code or (b) promoting, marketing or recommending to another party any transaction or matter addressed herein. YOU HAVE CONTACTED A DEBT COLLECTOR AND ANY INFORMATION OBTAINED MAY BE USED FOR THAT PURPOSES UNDER FEDERAL LAW.

THIS ELECTRONIC MAIL TRANSMISSION AND ANY ATTACHMENTS MAY CONTAIN PRIVILEGED, CONFIDENTIAL, OR PROPRIETARY INFORMATION INTENDED ONLY FOR THE PERSON(S) NAMED. IF THE READER OF THIS MESSAGE IS NOT THE INTENDED RECIPIENT OR THE AUTHORIZED REPRESENTATIVE OF THE INTENDED RECIPIENT, YOU ARE HEREBY NOTIFIED THAT ANY DISTRIBUTION, COPYING, OR DISCLOSURE OF THIS COMMUNICATION IS STRICTLY PROHIBITED. Pursuant to the above rights and privileges, immediately DELETE and DESTROY all copies of the email and its attachments, in whatever form, and immediately NOTIFY the sender of your receipt of this email. DO NOT review, copy, or rely on in any way the contents of this email and its attachments. All rights of the sender for violations of the confidentiality and privileges applicable to this email and any attachments are expressly reserved. This E-mail (including attachments) is covered by the Electronic Communications Privacy Act, 18 USC Sections 2510-2521, is confidential and may be legally privileged.

<doc20210106212320.pdf>

CONFIDENTIALITY: This email and any attachments may be confidential and/or privileged and are therefore protected against copying, use, disclosure or distribution. If you are not the intended recipient, please notify us immediately by replying to the sender and double deleting this copy and the reply from your system.

EXHIBIT B

Anulewicz, Chris

From: Kurt Hilbert <khilbert@hilbertlaw.com>
Sent: Thursday, January 7, 2021 9:18 AM
To: Anulewicz, Chris
Cc: ccarr@law.ga.gov; Timothy Revis; Ray S. Smith, III; dfg@guldenschuhlaw.com; rwillard@law.ga.gov; Hollis, Jim
Subject: RE: Confidential

[External Email] Please use caution.

We will be filing our dismissals this morning. I will notify the court after doing so, and will copy you on that email.

Kurt R. Hilbert, Esq.
Managing Member

THE HILBERT LAW FIRM, LLC

Mailing Address:
205 Norcross Street
Roswell, GA 30075
T: 770-551-9310
F: 770-551-9311
khilbert@hilbertlaw.com
www.hilbertlaw.com

IRS Circular 230 disclosure: To ensure compliance with requirements imposed by the IRS, we inform you that any U.S. federal tax advice contained in this communication (including any attachments) is not intended or written to be used, and cannot be used, for the purpose of (a) avoiding penalties under the Internal Revenue Code or (b) promoting, marketing or recommending to another party any transaction or matter addressed herein. YOU HAVE CONTACTED A DEBT COLLECTOR AND ANY INFORMATION OBTAINED MAY BE USED FOR THAT PURPOSES UNDER FEDERAL LAW.

THIS ELECTRONIC MAIL TRANSMISSION AND ANY ATTACHMENTS MAY CONTAIN PRIVILEGED, CONFIDENTIAL, OR PROPRIETARY INFORMATION INTENDED ONLY FOR THE PERSON(S) NAMED. IF THE READER OF THIS MESSAGE IS NOT THE INTENDED RECIPIENT OR THE AUTHORIZED REPRESENTATIVE OF THE INTENDED RECIPIENT, YOU ARE HEREBY NOTIFIED THAT ANY DISTRIBUTION, COPYING, OR DISCLOSURE OF THIS COMMUNICATION IS STRICTLY PROHIBITED. Pursuant to the above rights and privileges, immediately DELETE and DESTROY all copies of the email and its attachments, in whatever form, and immediately NOTIFY the sender of your receipt of this email. DO NOT review, copy, or rely on in any way the contents of this email and its attachments. All rights of the sender for violations of the confidentiality and privileges applicable to this email and any attachments are expressly reserved. This E-mail (including attachments) is covered by the Electronic Communications Privacy Act, 18 USC Sections 2510-2521, is confidential and may be legally privileged.

-----Original Message-----

From: Anulewicz, Chris <canulewicz@balch.com>
Sent: Thursday, January 7, 2021 9:16 AM
To: Kurt Hilbert <khilbert@hilbertlaw.com>
Cc: ccarr@law.ga.gov; trevis@hilbertlaw.com; Ray S. Smith, III <rsmith@smithliss.com>; dfg@guldenschuhlaw.com; rwillard@law.ga.gov; Hollis, Jim <jhollis@balch.com>
Subject: Re: Confidential

Kurt—

I left you a voice message. Please confirm you are withdrawing these cases and please email me copies of these withdrawals. We need to also let the Court know.

—Chris

Sent from my iPhone

On Jan 7, 2021, at 12:28 AM, Anulewicz, Chris <canulewicz@balch.com> wrote:

Mr. Hilbert—

Thank you for your correspondence of earlier tonight. While I appreciate the willingness of you and your clients to avoid protracted litigation in which, as indicated in my letter of January 3, 2020, we strongly believe the State will prevail, I want to make sure that there are no misunderstandings about either my letter or what the Secretary is willing to do once the pending cases have been dismissed. The letter was not a settlement offer, as you characterize it, but simply a statement that my client was not able to sit down and discuss the issues raised by your clients while there was active litigation by your clients against my client and other state officials. As a result, unless and until your clients met the condition precedent of dismissing all pending cases against state officials, my client would not be able to sit down and discuss the data analysis included in your clients' complaints, including showing how both the underlying data and the accompanying analysis are flawed.

As your clients have now indicated an intent to dismiss the pending cases, my client's offer to voluntarily sit down and discuss, as stated in my letter of January 3, 2020, "as much information with you as we can" outside of the context of ongoing litigation can proceed following your clients' voluntary dismissal of the identified litigation. We cannot agree to provide you access to information that is required by law to remain confidential, but that information should not be necessary to complete the type of discussion contemplated in the prior conversation with Ryan Germany comparing the information relied upon by your experts with the information utilized in the conduct of Georgia's electoral process. While your letter does not specifically state that your clients desire access to confidential information, I wanted to make clear that the Secretary cannot agree to such a request if that was contemplated in your stated intention to dismiss the litigation to complete the Secretary's condition precedent to voluntarily sitting down with you outside the threat of ongoing litigation.

Once your client has voluntarily dismissed the litigation identified in your letter, you can work through Russell Willard and Charlene McGowan in the Attorney General's office to set up a meeting with the Secretary's office. Once the litigation is dismissed, my appointment as a Special Assistant Attorney General will conclude. I look forward to receiving confirmation of the dismissal of the identified litigation. Otherwise, we stand ready to proceed with the scheduled hearing and trial on Friday.

Chris Anulewicz

Sent from my iPhone

<Balch_Logo_17db8ea2-760c-49c3-b0ff-19f80bb6a179.jpg>

Christopher S. Anulewicz, Partner, Balch & Bingham LLP
30 Ivan Allen Jr. Boulevard, N.W. • Suite 700 • Atlanta, GA 30308-3036
t: (404) 962-3562 f: (866) 320-6758 e: canulewicz@balch.com
www.balch.com<http://www.balch.com>

On Jan 6, 2021, at 9:36 PM, Kurt Hilbert <khilbert@hilbertlaw.com> wrote:

[External Email] Please use caution.

General Carr and Chris-

Please see the attached acceptance letter of your settlement terms from Sunday.

Have a pleasant evening. I look forward to coordinating promptly as per the letter attached.

Kurt R. Hilbert, Esq.
Managing Member
<http://www.hilbertlaw.com/>
<http://www.hilbertlaw.com/>
<image001.png>
THE HILBERT LAW FIRM, LLC
Mailing Address:
205 Norcross Street
Roswell, GA 30075
T: 770-551-9310
F: 770-551-9311
khilbert@hilbertlaw.com<mailto:khilbert@hilbertlaw.com>
www.hilbertlaw.com<http://www.hilbertlaw.com/>

IRS Circular 230 disclosure: To ensure compliance with requirements imposed by the IRS, we inform you that any U.S. federal tax advice contained in this communication (including any attachments) is not intended or written to be used, and cannot be used, for the purpose of (a) avoiding penalties under the Internal Revenue Code or (b) promoting, marketing or recommending to another party any transaction or matter addressed herein. YOU HAVE CONTACTED A DEBT COLLECTOR AND ANY INFORMATION OBTAINED MAY BE USED FOR THAT PURPOSES UNDER FEDERAL LAW.

THIS ELECTRONIC MAIL TRANSMISSION AND ANY ATTACHMENTS MAY CONTAIN PRIVILEGED, CONFIDENTIAL, OR PROPRIETARY INFORMATION INTENDED ONLY FOR THE PERSON(S) NAMED. IF THE READER OF THIS MESSAGE IS NOT THE INTENDED RECIPIENT OR THE AUTHORIZED REPRESENTATIVE OF THE INTENDED RECIPIENT, YOU ARE HEREBY NOTIFIED THAT ANY DISTRIBUTION, COPYING, OR DISCLOSURE OF THIS COMMUNICATION IS STRICTLY PROHIBITED. Pursuant to the above rights and privileges, immediately DELETE and DESTROY all copies of the email and its attachments, in whatever form, and immediately NOTIFY the sender of your receipt of this email. DO NOT review, copy, or rely on in any way the contents of this email and its attachments. All rights of the sender for violations of the confidentiality and privileges applicable to this email and any attachments are expressly reserved. This E-mail (including attachments) is covered by the Electronic Communications Privacy Act, 18 USC Sections 2510-2521, is confidential and may be legally privileged.

<doc20210106212320.pdf>

CONFIDENTIALITY: This email and any attachments may be confidential and/or privileged and are therefore protected against copying, use, disclosure or distribution. If you are not the intended recipient, please notify us immediately by replying to the sender and double deleting this copy and the reply from your system.